

The Green Paper

What's in it for us?

But first a digression

The Wolf is at the door

What the Wolf said about UK VET

- ‘Churning’ youth
- Lack of English and Mathematics skills
- Failure of the qualifications system – perverse incentives
- A qualifications system unable to cope with complexity
- Lack of progression
- Need for a broad general curriculum
- Overlapping and non-accountable centralised regulatory bodies

What UK government accepted

- A broad general academic curriculum with progression
- Stop providing language and mathematics lite
- Avoid over specification
- End the perverse incentives caused by indiscriminate equivalencies and the funding of qualifications
- Decentralise and simplify management and regulation
- Strengthening vocational teaching in schools and work experience

References

- Wolf, A. 2011. *Review of Vocational Education – The Wolf Report*. London: Department of Education
<https://www.education.gov.uk/publications/eOrderingDownload/The%20Wolf%20Report.pdf>
- Department of Education. 2011. *Wolf Review of Vocational Education - Government Response*. London: Department of Education.
https://www.education.gov.uk/publications/eOrderingDownload/Wolf-Review_Response.pdf

Green paper for Post-School Education and Training

- Last stand?
- New beginning?
- What Baatjes and Hamilton said
- A note on origins
 - NEET studies
 - Umalusi
 - Bird *et al*

Watch your language

- Frequency: -- Education; Training; System; Students; Quality
- Description: -- Development; Quality; Africa(n); Need(s);
Support: Ensure; Assurance
- Systems must be coherent, aligned, integrated
- Subjects: Science/engineering/technology; Language; Maths
- Little on Mother-tongue
[Zawada, B.E. (UNISA)]
- Oh, and get a good editor: “The government of South Africa has resolved to make reducing employment its priority concern...”

What the Minister says:

- Employment
- Employment
- Oh, and development and transformation
- High quality university education (to get a job)
- More research (blue sky too!)
- Public engagement wanted — so send in your comments

The executive summary

- Still inequalities and lots of NEETs
- Poor quantity, diversity and quality
- Lots of plans too
- “a single, coherent, differentiated and highly articulated” system [**is this oxymoronic?**]
- Increase university enrolments from 900 000 to 1.5 million (by two thirds again) [**what about quality?**]
- Increase FET, other colleges and PALCs (CETCs) to 4 million
- Integrated system of data management needed

Executive summary – FET colleges

- Rapid expansion and diversification FET colleges
- Upgrading and training of FET lecturers and managers
- Improve student support
- Improve ICT
- Partnerships between colleges and employers
- Other colleges – better coordination needed
- Better regulation of FET and HE
- New Institute for Vocational and Continuing Education and Training (SAIVCET) to build institutional capacity
- Money from SETAs and NSF to public FET

Executive summary - differentiation

- The principle of institutional differentiation
- Supported by funding
- More stable funding for postgraduate study and research

Executive summary: Adult education

- Weak
- Few full-time staff
- Low enrolments
- New Community Education and Training Centres for out-of-school youth and adults
- PALCs to be absorbed into these

Executive summary: regulatory system

- Complex and difficult to understand
- Little success in safeguarding quality
- Barriers rather than enablers
- Dangers of SETA “contractualisation” with short-term focus on contract compliance not learning and impact
- Simplify NQF
- Clarify roles CHE, Umalusi and QCTO
- Non-formal education OK too!

Chapter 1: Terminology

- Vocational – a “middle level of education” [??? This is a misleading concept]
- Adult education and continuing education – what is left over ... “all other forms of education for adults” [??? Relegates adult education to the left overs]

Chapter 2: A vision

- Main purpose of Green paper
- The NEETs
 - 2.8 million aged 18 top 24 (about 1.5 less than Grade 10; 1 million less than grade 12, 0.5 million with NSC no exemption, 100 000 with NSC with exemption [oops ... how will you grow universities by 600 000?])
- Therefore need foundation and bridging programmes
- Free for the poor
- Enabling environment for private provision
- CETCs
- Better articulation
- No dead end qualifications
- Better RPL

Chapter 3: Challenges

- Need more PhDs
- More black and female lecturers [**but based upon out of date 2006 data**]
- Lack of coherence
- Complex and problematic regulatory system
- Too few opportunities for pre-Grade 12 school leavers
- The inverted pyramid of HE and FET colleges
- Mid-term need for support for post-school learners to make transition

Challenges: continued

- Many weak FET colleges
- Few programmes to train FET college staff
- Overloaded expectation that FET will be all things to all learners
- Weak PALC system, under resourced and unproductive, with very few full-time staff
- Problems with learnerships/apprenticeships
- Universities of Technology – mission drift
- Low success rate and throughput at universities
- Do not see student support as part of core role

Challenges: continued

- “Our system has created a proliferation of qualifications and unit standards, but there has been no corresponding proliferation of learning or of educational provision.”
- “International and South African research has demonstrated that unit standards tend to fragment knowledge and militate against the coherence necessary to address the mastery requirements of specific professions.”
- Confusion about learnerships, apprenticeships and N courses
- System discouraged horizontal progression – you have to move up the NQF ladder
- Turf wars between CHE, Umalusi and QCTO
- Quality assurance and contractualisation [See pp. 17-18]

Challenges: continued

- Funding of HE biased to research at expense teaching
- Little funding from SETAs and NSF to FET colleges (SETAs fund short unit-standards based courses often of little value) or for NFE (collapse of NPO provision)
- [Doesn't address the crucial issue of the poor quality of Department of Basic Education schooling output – mediocre and innumerate]

Chapter 4: Colleges

- Strengthen, expand and diversify
- Private provision to complement with streamlined regulatory system
- Better coordination of funding with norms and standards
- “Most of our colleges are weak institutions.”
- Differentiation with varying degrees of autonomy
- Training (including long term) for lecturers and managers and exposure to workplace via partnerships
- Long term contracts for lecturers
- Admission tests for students

Colleges: continued

- FET colleges aimed at 16 to 24 year olds wanting to become artisans, etc. and offering NCV and more focussed programmes including apprenticeships and learnerships
- The problem of the derisory output from the NCV with two preferred options:
 - NCV for Grade 12 entrants only
 - One NCV for Grade 9 entrants and shorter one for Grade 12 entrants
- Issue of the NQF 5 N courses
- NCV as a dead end qualification

Colleges: continued

- Need for foundational, bridging and support (with state funding)
- NSFAS for FET sector
- More flexible delivery modes needed
- Must move away from cost recovery funding model based upon enrolments
- Also to offer National Senior Certificate for Adults (NASCA)

Colleges: continued

- Community Education and Training Centres [pp. 30-32]
- PALCs have weak capacity to handle the new NASCA
- No register of NPO and private adult education and training centres
- Very few tenured PALC and private centre staff
- PALCs to be absorbed into CETCs – strong PALCs, colleges and FET colleges [**Note: Green paper very weak on adult education and on need for universities to support CETCs**]
- Core funding, core staff on long-term contracts
- Initially offer ABET and NASCA but later skills and other programmes.

Colleges: continued

- South African Institute for Vocational and Continuing Education and Training [See pp 34-35 for its activities]
- [Ignores need for a dedicated Adult Education Institute [necessary if broad adult education is not to be relegated]]
- [Ignores Kha Ri Gude literacy campaign as an alternative model for much ABET and adult education delivery]

Chapter 5: Workplace-Based Learning

- Oops, who was meant to write this chapter?
- Change unnecessary accreditation requirements for government departments. Only providers offering national qualifications should have to be registered.
- Alignment with unit standards is not a requirement for training (a common misperception)
- [Green Paper is weak and silent on entrepreneurship]

Chapter 6: Universities

- Disappearance of the males
- But fewer black females at PhD level
- Crisis in the humanities
- Differentiated system needed but “further categorisation of institutions should be avoided”, “mix and level of programmes offered at any institution should not be fixed” and all universities “must offer a high quality undergraduate education” [but also need bridging courses].
- Support for 4-year undergraduate degrees
- Funding (for medium to long-term) negotiations with DHET [that is how differentiation will be enforced]

Universities: continued

- Too few PhDs
- More student accommodation
- More equity in infrastructure funding
- Central procurement of electronic journals
- State-led publishing house for learning materials
- Unrealistic expectation of comparable research output
- Some universities can concentrate on learning and teaching
- New sites for teacher education delivery (*Teacher Development Plan*)

Universities (continued)

- Salaries OK [Oh yeah?]
- Workloads not OK (more staff needed)
- Need higher retirement age and use retired academics part-time
- Funding formula skewed in favour of research
- Need some earmarked funding
- Details on funding issues [p. 47]
- Inadequacies of NSFAS
- Private HE OK but need better data on it
- African languages insufficiently supported (especially in teacher education)
- Internationalisation – proceed with caution

Chapter 7: Disability

- Insufficient funding for some HEs

Chapter 8: Open and Distance Learning

- Open colleges?
- Lack of collaboration in HE DE
- Need for coordination of a network of online providers
- DL especially for educator and lecturer upgrading
- Need for student centres (at PALCs, Multi-Purpose Community Centres, UNISA offices, etc.?) [compare India and Namibia]
- Collaboration in developing Open Educational Resources (OER)(many other country examples) – DHET will invest in via SAIVCET and Open Licensing Framework

Chapter 10: Regulatory system

- Streamline
- SETAs have not met expectations – they do too many things [See p. 63 on what they should do] Many negative unintended consequences [See p. 65]
- SETA must fund public institutions
- NSF to concentrate on larger programmes and projects with simplified procedures
- Discretionary grants to ABET – No!. Should come from NSF or fiscus
Absence of monitoring and evaluation within SETA system
- Purpose of WSP and Annual Training report need revision

Regulatory system: continued

- Simplify NQF
- Remove levels and level descriptors but maintain hierarchy of qualifications
- SAQA to concentrate on articulation issues and mapping curricula against each other
- Unit standards (11 615 of them) – “a waste of time and resources” [Now they tell us, just when universities start to comply with outcomes based unit standards approach!]
- Umalusi can control some current NQF Level 5 qualifications “once the notion of level 5 as part of higher education is removed”
- One Council with three chambers, or as is, or dissolve QCTO and the CHE and Umalusi delegate to SETAs

Regulatory system continued

- Less bureaucracy more professional judgement
- Tight and focussed QA system for key national qualifications and institutions and a lighter touch for other provision
- HE curricula the responsibility of institutions
- For the rest Quality Assurance Councils to develop curriculum development capacity (SAIVCET)
- National Artisan Moderating Body (NAMB)
- Comprehensive monitoring and evaluation framework to be developed

Chapter 10: Articulation, Collaboration and Co-ordination

- Need good data
- Lack of congruence between datasets
- Model for comprehensive skills planning being developed

Chapter 11: Conclusion

- Articulation!!!
- Data!!!
- Simpler NQF